

A lifeline when someone disappears

What we know so far –

Experiences of racial discrimination against missing people and their families

January 2022

"Affected me for life, thinking if I was white they wouldn't treat me that way.

Introduction

People who go missing are usually in a vulnerable situation before they disappear and are at even greater risk of harm while missing. They may be at risk of exploitation, other forms of crime, mental health crisis, self-harm or suicide. The number of people who have died while missing has increased by 34% over the past 3 years to a new high of 955 people in 2019/20.¹ It is therefore crucial that when a family reports someone missing, they know that professionals will take the report seriously and work with the family to find and safeguard the missing person.

A number of people have made disclosures to Missing People's support services about experiencing racial discrimination when reporting a loved one missing. This combined with growing awareness of discrimination in the statutory response to a range of other issues; and recent high-profile cases of missing people whose families have spoken about being discriminated against, has shown an urgent need for more in-depth consideration of people of colour's experiences when missing, or reporting a loved one missing

We asked families and professionals to share their experiences with us to better understand what happened and the impact that this has on people. The aims of this work are to amplify families' voices in order to improve the response for missing people of colour, and to challenge poor practice.

In this briefing we are using the term 'people of colour' as an inclusive and unifying term for people from different racial groups that are not white.

Our focus has been on families' experiences of reporting a loved one missing to the police and the response to their reports. Our findings are based on a relatively small sample. There is an urgent need for further research into the issues that we raise.

1 NCA Missing Persons Statistical Report 2019-20

We are aware of national research exploring the nature and scale of potential discrimination in police decision-making during missing person investigations. Our work complements that quantitative research by exploring families and professionals' perspectives on discrimination.

This report primarily focuses on people of colour's experiences of discrimination in the police response to missing people, as well as some consideration of discrimination in the media reporting of missing people. This is due to the disclosures to the charity being specifically about those two sectors. We have used a qualitative approach with the aim of amplifying the voices of people who have shared their experience with us.

Missing People would like to thank everyone who has spoken up about their experiences so far to inform this briefing. We know that we need to hear more from people who have experienced discrimination, and hope to continue to reach out to people to help them to share their stories and experiences in a way that is safe and supportive for them to do so.

Context

As far as we are aware there is currently no UKbased research specifically on the impact that a family or missing person's race or ethnicity can have on the support provided by professionals, or people's experience of that support.

Given the lack of missing-specific research currently available we can only consider what is known about intersecting issues. It is worth considering the criminal justice response to people of colour as this may have an impact on relationships and interactions between communities and the police: "People from BAME communities are over-represented at almost all stages of the criminal justice process, disproportionately targeted by the police, more likely to be imprisoned and more likely to be imprisoned for longer than white British people".² Although the response to missing is not a criminal justice response, this may well have an impact on the experience of reporting someone missing, particularly in situations linked to criminal exploitation.

Research on communities' confidence in the police may also provide some insight into the experiences of missing people and their families. Statistics³ for 2019/20 show that this confidence is lower within Black communities than others. Research has highlighted that this is true amongst victims of crime⁴ specifically. This may in some ways be comparable to the experiences of those reporting someone missing.

There has been some research into the media coverage of missing people of different ethnic backgrounds. This has shown that missing appeals for people of colour have been less likely to get media attention or engagement on social media⁵. In the past year this disparity has begun to be acknowledged, and there are early signs of change in the focus given to missing people of colour.

Finally, it is important to note that statistics show that Black people are disproportionately represented in missing reports to the police: Black people make up 3% of the population of England and Wales, but 14% of the missing persons population⁶. Research is needed to understand why this disproportionality exists, however this briefing does not seek to provide those answers.

Missing People's role

This briefing focusses on the voices of people who have been discriminated against, acknowledging that those who have experienced this are best able to identify discrimination and the negative impact it has had for them.

As a charity supporting thousands of missing people and their families, we understand that there are often a variety of frustrations with the police's response to a missing episode. The families of colour who have spoken to us have shared experiencing additional and distinct challenges and race discrimination when reporting a person missing. It is vital that these voices are heard, taken seriously and steps are taken to create positive change.

As an organisation we acknowledge that we have not actively explored the links between ethnicity and missing, or experiences of race discrimination before this project began in early 2020. We have not done enough in the past, and we are only at the start of this work ensuring that people feel able to speak to us about the discrimination that they have experienced. We suspect that our findings will be an under-representation of the issue as families may

Population of England and Wales who are Black

Make up of the missing persons population



² https://irr.org.uk/research/statistics/criminal-justice/

^{3 &}lt;u>https://www.ethnicity-facts-figures.service.gov.uk/crime-justice-and-the-law/</u> policing/confidence-in-the-local-police/latest

⁴ https://www.ethnicity-facts-figures.service.gov.uk/crime-justice-and-the-law/

policing/confidence-in-the-local-police/latest 5 Reka Solymosi, University of Manchester, <u>https://osf.io/preprints/socarxiv/wugxs</u>

⁶ Source NCA Missing Persons Data Report 2019-20.

not have spoken to us about what was happening for them. We want to hear from more people with lived experience and learn from organisations who have led work on marginalised experiences and discrimination.

In this briefing we are reviewing what we do know and planning what best we can do next to support those who have experienced discrimination and to amplify their voices to create change.

People's experiences: case review and surveys⁷

As part of our evidence collection we carried out a review of Missing People's cases to identify those records where the family had identified that they were a victim of discrimination because of their or their missing loved one's race or ethnicity, or where information shared by the family with our frontline team led to them recording possible discrimination in their case notes. We identified 18⁸ cases that fit this criteria. As stated above, we suspect this number is an underestimate because we only know about experiences that families themselves have proactively shared with us.

We also conducted a survey seeking views from people of colour who had been missing, or had a loved one go missing. Due to relatively small numbers of responses (17 people), we have included analysis of them as consultation responses. The table below provides details of the ethnicity of those who completed the survey:

Asian / Asian British	4
Black / African / Caribbean / Black British	З
White*	З
Mixed / multiple ethnic groups	2
Other ethnic group	З
Prefer not to say	5

 $^{\ast} \text{The respondent}$ was white and speaking about the experience of a missing loved one who is a person of colour.

For the case file analysis we carried out a search of our case management system using the keywords: racism and discrimination, and other variations of those words. We then manually reviewed each case for inclusion.

The survey respondents were self-selecting. We shared the survey on social media through organic posts and paid-for ads. It was shared with professionals through our organisation's networks.

We carried out one focus group which was with Missing People's Family Support Team. This was exploratory and aimed to get a better understanding of the experiences of our team as they work directly with families of missing people on a daily basis. We acknowledge their views are only representative of our organisation but as experts in the field we identified them as key contributors.

Any quotes used in this briefing are verbatim apart from where there are square brackets where information has been redacted for the purpose of anonymity or clarity.

Both the case files and the survey responses raised a number of themes in people's experiences of discrimination throughout the missing journey:

When reporting a loved one missing:

Families spoke about the police not accepting the case when they tried to report their loved one missing. They spoke about how this decision was influenced by their or their missing person's race and often felt the decision would have been different if they were white.

Didn't feel believed or listened too. My child did not stay out and I felt the police just wanted to treat this as a child at a friend's house. I know it wasn't that. When my child had continuous episodes of missing police said it wasn't a concern it was my child's choice and therefore not being treated as missing. Police did not inform me that my child's case was closed, I had to call 999 and ask if they are coming to see me to report my child missing. Was informed he was not a missing person.

Quote from survey respondent

[Missing person] is 15 years old and went missing on [date], parents reported son missing to the police straight away. It took nearly 10 days for the Police to file him as a missing person and to contact us for publicity and family support

Notes from our case file

[Missing person's] mum feels that 'the police are discriminating against [missing person] because of his colour.' Initially, she says they lied to her about what they were doing and says that 4 days went by when nothing happened."

Notes from our case file

⁷ Please note that where quotes may be identifiable they have been redacted. This is demonstrated by the use of square brackets.

⁸ We also identified one case where a white Eastern European family had spoken about being discriminated against because of their ethnicity. We haven't included the case in this report as we are focused on the experiences of people of colour but it suggests further exploration is needed to understand the experiences of non-British people.

Other families suggested that people of colour are more likely to be assumed to be taking part in criminal activity because of their ethnic background or making 'poor life choices', rather than being considered as victims or as vulnerable.

As soon as police arrived, before they conducted their search, they separated myself and my wife and interviewed me like a criminal as I had something to do with child missing, I am of an ethnic group.

Quote from survey respondent

[The family have told us that] Due to possible racial bias [missing person] was viewed by the police as a mixed-race young man who was probably involved in something he shouldn't have been."

Notes from our case file

There is a need especially for families of colour voices to be heard and understood as we are the most affected by repeated missing episodes, serious youth violence and sent to prison as being deemed as making a lifestyle choice therefore tarnished as criminals as opposed to being seen as victims that should be rescued/ safeguarded and not punished.

There needs to be an empathetic response from Professionals/ practitioners in this particular field towards the family's situation and needs. To have a more strategic/urgent response for when families are raising concerns especially when it's said that the behaviours etc are out of character in such a short space of time."

Quote from survey respondent

At the point of risk assessment:

Families felt that the police had not taken their concerns seriously, including risk assessments being lower than the circumstances should have warranted and therefore not enough action being taken to find and safeguard the missing person. Some families felt that serious warning signs were ignored, possibly because the police made assumptions about what was happening.

As an ethnic minority I believe because I'm black, I was not taken seriously."

Quote from survey respondent

[Missing person] has learning disabilities and is a victim of CCE. In early incidents mum felt that police did not take risks seriously enough, were not communicating and were not prioritising her son. Felt this was because of racism."

Notes from our case file

I went to a local police station and reported my [age] years Indian wife missing. [...] After a long while I was told to go home and wait for the Police to attend. [...] I told them she has never gone missing [before] [...] [Many] Hours later I was visited at home by the Police. The first question was why did I leave the Police station when she was vulnerable and had a mental issue. I told them I was told to go home. Totally ignored. Lack of police interest. Assumed that it was normal. Family members conducting a nearby search found her. My wife had committed suicide [...]. Affect the whole family and immediate family. No support offered or directed to. Yet they took credit for searching."

Quote from survey respondent

During the missing investigation:

Families spoke about investigative actions not being pursued thoroughly. Examples included:



A few families mentioned a lack of communication and two specifically spoke about white family members being given more information than themselves as people of colour.

My partner is white and when there was an incident which involved my child and us, he was kept informed and I wasn't."

Quote from survey respondent

It was clear that families were frustrated by the lack of publicity and media attention that they felt is given to missing people from Black and minoritised ethnic communities.

Mum felt she was denied publicity because of race."

Notes from our case file

[caller] said she also felt that they were maybe being racially discriminated against because her son is black as she has seen that when white children going missing they get a lot more publicity and media attention."

Note from our case file

Missing person was black and her mum thinks this resulted in her not getting publicity"

Notes from our case file

Some respondents to our survey spoke about experiencing discriminatory or dismissive language:

Yea more than once. Ask if you black. Say cannot do anything. They say don't want to see you here" Quote from survey respondent

The discrimination experienced led to tone deaf stance, comments made that were disrespectful, insensitive and purposefully aimed to cause irreparable harm to child-parent relationship."

Quote from survey respondent

Impact on the families:

The impact of this discrimination was clear on those who responded to the survey. People spoke of distress, anger, feeling that their loved one's life was being devalued, and that this has had longlasting impacts. People spoke of their mental health being affected, family breakdown, and the impact of discrimination on the missing person themselves.

Affected me for life, thinking if I was white they wouldn't treat me that way."

Quote from survey respondent

The prolonged missing spells then turned into serious crime and incarceration dormant years now. There's a loss of hope for my child. I believe all our mental health has suffered."

Quote from survey respondent

The impact has been very heart breaking, causing extreme anxiety, depression and feeling helpless and alone. There was high evidence that many people that I knew of colour also were affected in the same way. The families that were affected that were not of colour had a more positive and higher level of emergency response to their cry for help."

Quote from survey respondent

Survey of professionals working with missing people

In addition to the survey for people of colour with experience of discrimination we also sought the views of professionals who work with missing people. Again the sample size was small with 7 respondents but those people did share an interesting range of views. We did not ask the professionals to disclose their ethnicity.

The professionals who responded were varied in their views of whether discrimination impacted missing person investigations.

Those who identified discrimination:

Asked about racial discrimination, one police officer said, "As one of very few minority police officers, I usually ended up dealing with BAME missing persons and/or their families. White officers would generally do computer checks and leave it at that. Supervising officers would mark up and falsify records to show enquiries were being made." This officer then went on to illustrate the contrast "Children missing from secure homes were not given the priority. Vulnerable people were not given the priority. When it came to a white family, senior officers and the press would get involved. More checks were done as were more door knocking. There was a stark difference."

One person who worked with the families of missing persons remarked that *"I have noticed that when young black boys go missing it is not treated as seriously as when a [white] young male goes missing. It is seen as less urgent or less important".*

A charity worker observed that "Many parents from Black/Black British communities have told us on a number of occasions that they would no longer attempt to report their children as missing, as they felt that they were not being taken seriously by the Police. This often led to parents developing a sense of distrust towards the network of professionals as a whole. One parent once said: 'What is the point of reporting my child as missing. For the Police he's just another Black kid getting in trouble, so they're just not interested.'"

Those who did not identify any discrimination:

One police officer stated *"I have never seen racial discrimination play a part in a missing person investigation in 12 years of policing".*

Those who suggested there may be a range of factors:

A police officer said "I think that there is unconscious bias in all organisations but overt discrimination is very rare. I also feel that minority ethnic communities often perceive discrimination, sometimes that is justified, but at other times there is no actual discrimination, just a perception of discrimination." And in response to a later question: "Unfortunately, the police do not have the resources to investigate missing persons sufficiently to meet the expectations of families irrespective of ethnicity. I do not think this is a discrimination issue, it is due to the massive reductions in police budgets as a result of austerity over ten years."

In relation to this last point, national research has shown that police budget cuts have impacted missing person investigations, particularly in recent years.⁹ Missing People regularly hears from family members of all ethnicities that they are frustrated by the investigation into their loved one's missing episode, and think that the police could do more to find their loved one. However, families and professionals, including staff in our own services, have told us that the discrimination they have experienced or observed is distinct from these broader frustrations. Failing to acknowledge those experiences and their difference from general complaints about practice risks compounding experiences of discrimination and further silencing people in circumstances where it is already difficult to speak out.

Due to the small number of respondents it is not possible to draw any finite conclusions from the responses to the professionals survey. However it is important to note that the majority of those who did fill out the survey did identify that they had witnessed some discrimination, whether conscious or unconscious.

⁹ M. Greenhalgh & K. Shalev Greene, 'Impact of Police Cuts on Missing Person Investigations', University of Portsmouth, Centre for the Study of Missing Persons, July 2021: https://pure.portac.uk/ws/portalfiles/portal/28691081/Final version. pdf

Missing People team focus group

To further explore the views of professionals working with missing people we held a small focus group with staff members from our Family Support Team. These staff members provide support through our helpline to families of missing people throughout their loved one's disappearance. Observations from the focus group included:

Black boys and boys from other minority ethnicities are more likely to be described as 'putting themselves in a dangerous position' or perceived to be in more control of their situation. Despite in some cases the child having specifically said they're fearful.

This adultification of some children means risk can be misidentified or warning signs of exploitation can be missed.

- The police's approach to risk assessments seems in some cases to be informed by their preconceptions about what has happened, or assumptions about the young person.
- Staff understood the limitations on police resources but felt that the allocation of those resources sometimes seems to vary depending on the perception of people's ability to advocate for themselves. They spoke about this negatively impacting some of the people of colour we support as they may feel less able to challenge the police, in part due to historic and recent mistreatment contributing to distrust; or they may feel more judged if they complain or challenge the response they are receiving.
- The team identified examples of circumstances which can lead to poorer responses from professionals, and which are disproportionately experienced by some young people of colour, thereby compounding experiences of discrimination.
- I In some cases, the team felt that the police don't keep families informed when it's perceived as more 'difficult' to do so, for example when English is not the family member's first language.
- Some families have spoken about not wanting to report their child as missing because of poor responses from the police in the past, sometimes in experiences unrelated to the missing episode. It has been observed that any lack of trust in the police can impact on relationships within missing investigations. Poor police responses in early episodes, or early in a single episode, can break down that trust.

The team identified that police attitude is the biggest issue. They have witnessed some examples of action not being taken or less being done, but often it is the officers' attitude and the way they communicate with and treat the families that shows discrimination.

Police complaints related to missing persons and discrimination

In June 2021, we made a Freedom of Information request to police forces in the UK asking for details of complaints relating to missing persons cases, and how many of those were related to discrimination.¹⁰

Some forces (14) were not able to provide any of the requested information, and some (26) were only able to provide answers to part,¹¹ so the analysis we are able to carry out is limited, and it is likely that we do not have the full picture of complaints to police forces.

Overall, the number of complaints related to missing person investigations shared by police forces was small (97 in 2019-20, and 190 in 2020-21) and very few related to discrimination (1 in 2019-20, and 6 in 2020-21). However, of those that were reported, all of the complaints in 2020-21 about discrimination were related to race rather than any other protected characteristic.

As part of our evidence gathering we also reviewed complaints members of the public made to the Independent Office for Police Complaints. We found that, in 2020-21, 292 referrals were made to the IoPC involving missing person investigations, of which 4 cases involved discrimination. Of the investigations that the IoPC went on to open, one in eleven cases (3 of 33) linked to discrimination. We do not have a breakdown of the type of discrimination so cannot confirm whether all these cases related to race or other protected characteristics.

¹⁰ The request asked for information about the number of these complaints in 2019/20 and 2020/21 that related to claims of discrimination based on the protected characteristics of age; disability; gender reassignment; race; religion or belief; and sex. In addition, forces were asked to detail how many complaints were made during the relevant periods in relation to 'Incivility, impoliteness and intolerance', and 'Lack of fairness and impartiality' and to provide breakdowns in each case of complainants' gender and race.

¹¹ By the 27th of August, 2021, returns had been received from 40 of the 46 forces to which the Fol request had been made. Of these 40, 26 (57%) provided at least some of the requested information, while 14 (30%) did not provide information. Almost all of the forces who did not provide information justified their refusal to comply with the request by citing Section 12 of the Freedom of Information Act 2000

Bibaa Henry and Nicole Smallman were reported missing on Saturday 6 June 2020. Their bodies were found by loved ones the next day.

Their mother, Mina Smallman, has spoken out about the police failures in the missing investigation and how these were driven by racism and assumptions made about her daughters *"I knew instantly why they didn't care. They didn't care because they looked at my daughter's address and they thought they knew who she was. "A black woman who lives on a council estate."*¹²

An IoPC investigation found that the Met failed to follow its missing persons policies, and the service the family received from the police was "unacceptable". However, it did not find racial bias to be a factor in the mishandling of the case.

Mina Smallman, as well as three ex-senior police officers,¹³ have challenged this finding and have stated that bias very much did play a role.

Missing people, discrimination and the media

As identified in the survey responses, coverage in the media can also contribute to families of colour's experiences of discrimination.

Research has shown that white missing people may receive more news attention, and their appeals may generate more engagement on social media platforms.¹⁴

"Missing white woman syndrome" describes the phenomenon of the media's extensive coverage of white, often middle-class, women and girls who have gone missing; disproportionate to when women, men or children of colour go missing. Research has shown that certain factors, including race and economic background, can affect the amount of media coverage for missing appeals and the amount of engagement with those appeals from the public. This issue has been largely researched in the USA but academics in the UK have suggested there are similar patterns in the media coverage in this country.¹⁵ One study in the UK reviewing the engagement with missing appeals on Twitter found that "Tweets about white missing persons had more retweets than tweets about ethnic minority missing persons".16

More recent news coverage has highlighted these disparities, with growing acknowledgement of the over-representation of Black people in the missing figures and the under representation of

14 https://blog.geographydirections.com/2020/07/09/missing-black-lives/

those missing people in the media. Articles from a range of mainstream media outlets including the BBC¹⁷, Independent¹⁸, Vice¹⁹ and Metro²⁰, have all acknowledged the lack of attention on missing Black people and other people of colour. Some articles have highlighted the fact that most if not all 'high-profile' cases have been those of white people, while people of colour who have gone missing in similar circumstances have not received the same attention.

Families of missing people have played a vital role in drawing attention to these disparities. Many have spoken out about the lack of media attention for missing people of colour. The mother of student Joy Morgan, who went missing in 2019 and was later found murdered, told the BBC her case didn't garner widespread attention: *"Because my daughter was Black and because I was Black I was not newsworthy."*²¹

It is also important to acknowledge the organisations that have been set-up by people of colour to specifically challenge these inequalities. In 2020 Black Lives Matter UK²² began publicising appeals for missing Black people on their website to raise awareness for cases where attention may not otherwise be focused; and MissingBlackPeople.com²³ was set up in 2021 to share appeals and to create a community for discussion about the issues.

¹² https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-england-london-57679755

¹³ Mother of murdered sisters backed by ex-police chiefs over bias claim | Police | The Guardian

¹⁵ https://blog.geographydirections.com/2020/07/09/missing-black-lives/

¹⁶ Exploring public engagement with missing person appeals on Twitter. Reka Solymosi, Oana Petcu & Jack Wilkinson

¹⁷ https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-england-london-57813139

¹⁸ https://www.independent.co.uk/news/uk/home-news/black-people-

missing-b1827530.html 19 https://www.vice.com/en/article/q5g8wb/mee-kuen-chong-missing-people-uk

²⁰ https://metro.co.uk/2021/09/24/black-people-are-turning-to-social-media-tofind-missing-loved-ones-15180337/

²¹ https://www.voice-online.co.uk/news/uk-news/2019/09/09/joy-morgans-mumno-one-cared-because-my-daughter-is-black/

²² https://blacklivesmatter.uk/missing

²³ https://www.missingblackpeople.com/

Conclusions

Our consultation has found that families of missing people have identified experiences of racial discrimination at all stages of the missing episode. Some professionals have also recognised in their experience of working with missing people and their families that discrimination happens in missing person investigations. Although we have not explored the impact of this discrimination in depth, it is clear from some of the family responses that this has a significant impact on their wellbeing and on professional and public efforts to find and safeguard their missing person.

Recommendations and next steps

This briefing will be shared with leaders across policing and other relevant sectors, as well as on our website, to ensure the people who spoke up about their experiences are heard. We hope their voices will help encourage reflection and a review of how discrimination, both conscious and unconscious, can be eliminated.

More research is needed to fully understand the nature and scale of race discrimination experienced by families of missing people and in the response to missing people. This research should look at every stage of a missing person's journey from the reasons why Black people are over-represented in missing statistics, to people of colour's experiences of reporting someone missing, to initial decisions made by the police in missing person risk assessments and decisions about whether to launch a missing person investigation, to how those decisions are reviewed, to how families are communicated with, to other professionals' responses, to the length of missing person investigations and their outcomes, to media and public engagement with missing person appeals. This research needs to combine quantitative data analysis, with individual experiences to provide a holistic, comprehensive picture. We are working with academic partners and organisations who are best placed to carry out this research.

We are also working with families at an individual level to advocate for a better response for their missing person. We plan to continue and to grow this advocacy role, challenging discriminatory practice or supporting families of missing people to do so.

Whilst the number of respondents to our research so far is relatively small, their experiences should raise significant concern, particularly when we consider the findings of wider research which has identified structural barriers for people of colour accessing services and support. All police forces and other professionals working with missing people should review their response to missing people of colour to ensure that people are not being discriminated against. Police forces should review the language used in missing person records; monitor decision-making processes; and review assigned risk assessment levels. Any evidence of bias or assumptions being made about people of colour should be examined and challenged. All agencies working with missing people should consider developing training for their staff about discrimination and bias.

Police forces should create supportive opportunities for engagement with people of colour affected by a missing incident to better understand their experiences and explore any issues. Forces could use Independent Advisory Groups to facilitate this work.

In response to the inequity in media coverage we plan to work with partner organisations, journalists and media agencies to produce guidance to ensure more equal coverage and public engagement with appeals for missing people of all ethnicities.

We need to learn more from people who have experienced discrimination to further build on this work. In light of this we have published a new survey through which we hope to hear from more people of colour who have been missing or reported a loved one missing. If you or someone you know has experienced discrimination the survey can be found here.

Ultimately, we want to work with people of colour to lead this work. We hope that we can help to amplify those voices and we are working to encourage people who are in a place to share their experiences to get in touch with us. If you would like to know more about this work or to share your experiences directly with us, please e-mail the Policy & Research team at Missing People at policyandresearch@missingpeople.org.uk.

If you have been affected by anything in this briefing please do contact Missing People's helpline on 116 000



NRF supported the design of this briefing.